UNT™

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS
Discover the power of ideas.

HARMONIA

Harmonia is the in-house journal of the Graduate Association of Musicologists und Theorists (GAMuT) at the University of North Texas. The objective of GAMuT is to provide a forum for the professional development of the graduate student community, and the annual publication of *Harmonia* functions in support of this goal.

The membership of GAMuT would like to extend its sincere appreciation to Dr. David Heetderks, and Dr. Brian Wright for their service as faculty reviewers for this volume of *Harmonia*.

Congratulations to Júlia Coelho, whose paper "Joachim Burmeister, Wolfgang Schonsleder, and Christian Bernhard: *Theory* or *Theories* of Musical-Rhetorical Figures?" was the winner of the 2020–2021 Graham H. Phipps Paper Award.

For information about submitting an article to *Harmonia*, please contact music.gamut@unt.edu.

HARMONIA

Volume 18 ▪ 2020–2021

The Journal of the Graduate Association of
Musicologists und Theorists at the
University of North Texas

CONTENTS

Joachim Burmeister, Wolfgang Schonsleder, and Christian Bernhard: *Theory* or *Theories* of Musical-Rhetorical Figures?
JÚLIA COELHO

Introduction

The emphasis on the relationship between rhetoric and music in the seventeenth century left a lasting mark on Western music theory in the centuries that followed. The link between these two arts has existed since antiquity, with thinkers such as Aristotle, Cicero, and Quintilianus establishing analogies between these disciplines. Quintilianus, for instance, held up music's expressivity as a model to the orator, although the opposite correlation became the most frequent in the Modern era.[1] Musico-rhetorical references were also present in the music theory of the Middle Ages. However, it was during the Renaissance period that such a relationship gained considerable strength, with the growing importance of rhetoric in humanistic education stimulated by the rediscovery of treatises by the above-mentioned ancient rhetoricians and philosophers.[2] Rhetoric thus became a significant compositional directive in shaping the aesthetics of musical works in this era.

The close connection between music and rhetoric is seen in the emergence of theories on musico-rhetorical figures in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries—with intricate systems in the German musico-rhetorical tradition—and continuing into the eighteenth century. In this article, I explore the relationship between these two disciplines within the seventeenth-century German history of music theory context with the use of the musico-rhetorical figures by three theorists: Joachim Burmeister (1564–1629), Wolfgang Schonsleder (1602–1680), and Christoph Bernhard (1628–1692). I focus on these writers' contributions to *musica poetica,* and how their different backgrounds and approaches demonstrate that there was not a unified system of musico-rhetorical figures, despite the shared ideas between their theories. Burmeister comes from a Lutheran *Lateinschule* perspective and adopts a prescriptive approach of Classical (verbal) rhetoric terms applied directly to musical figures, while Schonsleder chooses instead an inductive approach regarding affect expression in musical composition, influenced by a Jesuit

---

[1] See Aristides Quintilianus, *Institutio oratoria,* vol. I, trans. H. Butler (Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 1920), 165–77 for his discussion on music and rhetoric, referenced in Patrick McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," in *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*, ed. Thomas Christensen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 847.

[2] Quintilianus's *Institutio oratoria* was rediscovered in 1416; Aristotle's *The Art of Rhetoric*, as well as some lost treatises of Cicero, were likewise recovered around this time.

tradition. Bernhard also offers his contribution to the *theories* of musical rhetorical figures: like Burmeister, he comes from a Lutheran background, although the influence Bernhard received from Italian theorists, composers, and newly emerging vocal styles helped him reshape the idea of *musica poetica* in the late seventeenth century. To Bernhard, style and dissonance are, respectively, the guiding principles and compositional devices for affect expression in music. With such variety of perspectives regarding musical figures, I suggest using the expression "*Theories* of musico-rhetorical figures" rather than its singular. This subtle but important terminological difference better encapsulates the lack of uniformity found in approaches to a key concept in German *musica poetica.*

Building on the works of Dietrich Bartel, Patrick McCreless, and Massimo DiSandro, the aim of this article is to explore the intricacies and nuances of the seventeenth-century *musica poetica* in Germany outside of the broader umbrella of a "single theory" of musico-rhetorical figures.[3] Within this history of music theory context, I analyze how the three authors have brought up diverse perspectives and guiding principles, dividing this study into five main parts: after providing the general framework of *musica poetica,* I focus on Burmeister's theoretical standpoint based on his Classical and Lutheran backgrounds (within the *Lateinschule* frame), founding his *musica poetica* principles in verbal rhetoric rules. After, I proceed to analyze the Jesuit point of view of affect and its main guiding criteria in Schonsleder's approach (later expanded by Jesuit Athanasius Kircher). I then return to the Lutheran outlook by considering the Italian influences of Bernhard, who, in lieu of Classical rhetoric, uses dissonance as an important compositional device to express or shape affect in music and conceives style as the criterion for the classification of musical figures. In the last portion of this article, I briefly address the overall direction in which German *musica poetica* eventually went, given the waning of the rhetorical tradition in the eighteenth century with theorists such as Johannes Mattheson (1681–1764). Despite this last aspect, the importance of the aforementioned seventeenth-century authors is undeniable. Among them, Schonsleder's contribution deserves considerable attention, as it has thus far been understudied within the scholarship on musico-rhetorical figures. These authors helped shape the conversations surrounding *musica poetica* and the relationship between music and rhetoric; furthermore, whether directly or indirectly, they anticipated the development of the eighteenth-century *Affektenlehren.*[4]

---

[3] See McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric;" Dietrich Bartel, M*usica Poetica: Musical-Rhetorical Figures in German Baroque Music* (Lincoln, NE; London: University of Nebraska Press, 2009); and Pietro Cerone and Wolfgang Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation of Text in Vocal Polyphony*, ed. Massimo Di Sandro, trans. Júlia Coelho (Avellino: Edizioni Pasitea, 2017).
[4] See George Buelow, "Johann Mattheson and the inventio of the *Affektenlehre*," in *New Mattheson Studies*, edited by George L. Buelow, and

Rhetoric & Music – *Musica Poetica*

In traditional rhetoric, there are five canons established during the early Roman period: *inventio, dispositio, elocutio, memoria,* and *pronunciatio.* Of these, the first three represent the fundamental elements of rhetoric. *Inventio* pertains to a systematic search for arguments*, dispositio* refers to their organization, and *elocutio* (also named *decoratio*) concerns the arguments' expression and style*.* The latter refers to figures of speech and is related to eloquence, encompassing an idea of "excess" to Classical writers.[5] Despite the differences between the systems of Burmeister, Schonsleder, and Bernhard, they all stem from the Classical concept of *elocutio,* which were then adapted to music: musico-rhetorical figures are used to depict the meanings of words and have as their basis the correlation between rhetorical figures of speech and similar musical figures. The former comes from the Classical works convention of teaching orators to embellish their ideas with rhetorical imagery, i.e., *elocutio* or *decoratio.* By analogy, musico-rhetorical figures refer to verbal and musical embellishments called *ornamenta*, a term used by Burmeister in expanding the concept of *musica poetica* and helping bring rhetoric terminology into the fields of compositional techniques and musical analysis.

The appearance of figures in music (*ornamenta*) comes from the attempt to justify irregular or even incorrect contrapuntal writing, despite the different theoretical perspectives (as discussed in further detail later in this article). Even though the instances in which these figures occurred were contrary to counterpoint rules, they were suitable to express the text's affect; therefore, it became justifiable to break the compositional rules. As in the Monteverdi-Artusi controversy, "the music becomes a servant of the text," although (German) *musica poetica* did not always perfectly align with the *seconda prattica* principles as followed in Italy.[6] In the words of

---

Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 393–408. To read its primary source, see Johann Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister,* edited and translated by Ernest Charles Harris, Ph.D. dissertation (George Peabody College for Teachers, 1969).

[5] See McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 847–51.

[6] To Giulio Cesare Monteverdi, "by Second Practice, ... he [Claudio Monteverdi] understands the one that turns on the perfection of the melody, that is, the one that considers harmony not commanding, but commanded, and makes the words the mistress of the harmony." Giulio Cesare Monteverdi, *Source Readings: Classical Antiquity through Romantic*, ed. by Oliver Strunk (New York: W. W. Norton, 1950), 408–10. Original in *Claudio Monteverdi: lettere, dediche e prefazioni,* ed. Domenico De' Paoli (Rome: Edizioni De Santis, 1973), 399. According to the *Accademia della Crusca,* "*Affetto*" is a "passion of the soul, born of the desire for good, and the hatred for evil." [Original: "*Passione d'animo, nata dal desiderio del bene, e dall'odio del male*"]. See *Accademia della Crusca* [Online], "Affetto," accessed October 2020. http://www.lessicografia.it/Controller?lemma=affetto. For

McCreless, rhetoric "gained a strong foothold in music only in the German tradition. Unlike the German theorists, they [Italian, French, and British theorists] do not attempt to correlate rhetorical principles with music-theoretical ones."[7] With the exception of Gioseffo Zarlino, they conceived "their music-theoretical business in musical, not rhetorical terms," which is in stark contrast with the early stages of the German *musica poetica.*[8]

Theories of musico-rhetorical figures do not always offer a unified terminology between different authors. Some musical figures that might signify a similar idea or affect are often given a substantially different name from theorist to theorist. The issue, however, goes far beyond mere nomenclature: frequently the writer's diverse influences—such as Lutheran and *Lateinschule* tradition, Jesuit doctrine, or (an adaption of) Italian *seconda prattica*—tended to shape different ideas on how to explain and categorize musico-rhetorical figures, their association with rhetoric, and how they express a particular affect. Beyond terminology and traditions, the idea of "figure" itself could also diverge conceptually between authors. While to some it referred to overall musical ideas, to others it pertained to ornaments and embellishing notes; further, it could also signify effect—and *affect*. The *musica poetica* was indeed, to borrow McCreless's words, "hardly a monolithic system" due to the many nuances between theorists' ideas and their diverse influences.[9]

One of the changes observed in the history of German *musica poetica* was the gradual shift over the seventeenth century from *docere / probare* [to teach] towards *movere / flectere* [to move] (while *delectare / conciliare* [to delight] was never its ultimate goal). Such a shift resulted from the growing interest in the affects or passions and their expression in rhetoric, music, and poetics. Consequently, this change also entailed a preference for *elocutio* over *inventio* and *dispositio.*[10] Such modifications over time can be observed through a juxtaposition of Burmeister's strong emphasis on Classical verbal rhetoric terms applied to music and the subsequent increased interest in affect and style used in musical text, such as in the theories of Schonsleder and Bernhard, who helped re-shape the *musica poetica* tradition.

---

further insight regarding the concept of "affetto" (as affections or passions) in Modern Italy in its genesis, see Andrew Dell'Antonio, *Listening as Spiritual Practice in Early Modern Italy* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011), and Sara M. Pecknold, "Relics, Processions and the Sounding of Affections: Barbara Strozzi, the Archduchess of Innsbruck, and Saint Anthony of Padua," *Yale Journal of Music & Religion* 2, No. 2. (September 24, 2016), 77–94.

[7] McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 852.

[8] See McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 852.

[9] McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 853.

[10] See McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," and Brian Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2002), 282.

From Lutheran *Lateinschule* to Joachim Burmeister's *Musica Poetica*: Verbal and Musical Rhetoric

Although the integration of the rhetorical and musical disciplines had been heavily stimulated by Martin Luther (1483–1546)—influenced by the considerable emphasis on linguistic subjects during the Renaissance—it is only around 1600 that a more systematic use of principles and terms appeared: rhetorical concepts were applied specifically to music by Lutheran *Kantor* and Latin teacher Burmeister under the category *musica poetica*.[11] The term *musica poetica* echoes the importance of the *trivium* elements within music: it refers to a musical composition for voice, where the "musician-poet" is to present the text in a musical oration, emphasizing the aspect of rhetoric as its crucial element.[12] Regarding the origins of *musica poetica*, Luther helped to open the way for a synthesis between *musica speculativa / theorica* and *musica practica*, with his concerns regarding the practical use of music.[13] This approach facilitated *musica poetica* as a third category, as defended by seventeenth-century theorist Andreas Herbst (1588–1666).[14]

---

[11] For further readings on the term *musica poetica,* see Karl Braunschweig, "Genealogy and 'Musica Poetica.' In Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Theory," *Acta Musicologica* 73, No. 1 (2001), 45–75. Burmeister studied at the *Lateinschule,* where he had his rhetoric instruction with Lucas Lossius. Lossius's writings on rhetoric became crucial to Burmeister's theory. He later did his master's in Law, and worked as *Kantor* in Rostock's main church, following the Lutheran tradition, and teaching both Latin and music. He wrote three treatises where he addressed the issue of *musica poetica,* although the last is the most complete one: *Hypomnematum musicae poeticae* (1599) [22 musico-rhetorical figures]; *Musica autoschediastike* (1601) [25 musico-rhetorical figures]; and *Musica Poetica* (1605) [with 26 figures in total].

[12] Bartel, "Luther on Music: A Theological Basis for German Baroque Music," in *Musica Poetica*, 4 and 20. Although music was the most important discipline of the *quadrivium* to Luther*,* the strong emphasis during the Renaissance on linguistic disciplines—namely rhetoric—permeated the Lutheran *Lateinschule* curriculum, facilitating the union between rhetoric and music.

[13] Bartel, *Musica Poetica*, 20. Later in the eighteenth century, Johann Georg Sulzer (1720–79) and Johann Forkel (1749–1818) delved into such a synthesis project. To Sulzer, in Christensen's words, "*theory* would necessarily encompass those 'practical' elements of taxonomy and regulation necessary to the instruction of any art in addition to its more abstracted, normative principles," and Forkel "proposed a systematic program of study he called *Theorie der Musik* that seemed to fulfil Sulzer's plan." See Christensen, "Introduction," in *Western Music Theory*, 9.

[14] Before Burmeister, this term was used for the first time in the sixteenth century by Lutheran Nicolaus Listenius (1513–?), and later in 1563 was used as a name of a treatise by Gallus Dressler (1533–1580/9), applied both as a genre and as a discipline.

Considering the specific rhetorical tasks in the Lutheran tradition of admonishing and edifying the congregation, on the one hand, and the substantial weight of music as a pedagogical tool (*docere / probare* [to teach]), on the other, the ultimate goal of music in such context was not *movere / flectere* (to move) the listeners, but rather to help them become receptive to the Word.[15] As noted by McCreless, rhetoric was also used for text exegesis, which is evident in Burmeister's use of figures as an analytical tool.[16] Therefore, music was "not just a passive reflection of the text but an advocate of the text:" this principle was one of the main concerns of Lutheran theorists and composers, such as Burmeister.[17] In contrast with the Italian *seconda prattica*—despite the adoption of some Italian terms, genres, and styles later seen in Bernhard—the primary function of portraying affections for German theorists was not to delight the senses [*delectare / conciliare*], as Bartel indicates.[18] This aspect constitutes a considerable difference between the German Lutheran and Italian musico-rhetorical theories of the early seventeenth century. As Bartel puts it,[19]

> the Italian rejection of music's numerological and cosmological significance in favor of its direct affective and aesthetic effect led to a form of musical expression which focused on a modern aesthetic principle of expressing and stirring the affections rather than explaining the text.

In the tradition just described, the text was undoubtedly central to the composition; however, it became almost the foundation for musical expression—instead of the object of the composition, as it happens instead in the Germanic tradition during the same time.

The contrast between Italian and German perspectives is particularly evident in Burmeister's theory of musico-rhetorical figures: its logocentric affiliation, attempting to construct a system of rhetoric applicable to both music and language, takes verbal rhetoric as its starting point. In other words, Burmeister's definitions of figures seem better suited to (verbal) rhetoric. Such thought was already expressed by early seventeenth-century theorist Johannes Nucius (*c.* 1556–1620), who develops a classification derived from the musical

---

[15] Luther maintained that preaching also happens through music, especially when combined with sacred text, having what he called a "Sermon in sound: … After theology, I accord to music the highest place and the greatest honor." Martin Luther, quoted in Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 7.

[16] See McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 856. See also George Buelow, Blake Wilson, and Peter Hoyt, "Rhetoric and Music," in *Grove Music Online* (20 January 2001), accessed 1 December 2020, https://doi-org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.arti-cle.43166.

[17] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 8.

[18] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 59.

[19] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 59.

figures themselves (as done later by Christoph Bernhard), instead of following Burmeister's theoretical foundation on rhetorical figures that stemmed directly from Classical antiquity.[20]

Considering the possible complications of departing from verbal rhetorical concepts and then applying them to music, how does one know when and where to use figures, according to Burmeister? The author answers the question in this manner: [21]

> If the student wishes to know when and where the composition is to be adorned [*ornamenta*] with these figures, he is carefully to examine the text of a composition, especially one which uses the specific ornament, and then adorn a similar text with the same figure. Should he do this in such a manner, the text itself will prescribe the rules.

This statement demonstrates that text-rhetoric in Burmeister's theory is prescriptive, presupposing an in-depth knowledge of Classical linguistic disciplines in the first place in order to be able to identify such figures.

Although four of Burmeister's figures are based on direct musical terms instead of on Classical rhetorical ones, all the other *ornamenta* are rooted in verbal figures of speech (i.e., *decoratio*), adopting and applying the Greek rhetorical terms to his musical figures (as seen in table 1). Because of the correlation between speech rhetoric terms and musical figures, Burmeister makes a parallel between "word" (speech) and "melody" (musical) figures on the one hand, and "sentence" and "harmony" figures on the other.[22] Following the two-fold grouping of Classical rhetorical figures into figures of thought and figures of diction—according to Bartel—Burmeister divides the *ornamenta musicae* into these two main classes: *harmonia* and *melodia.*[23]

From this two-fold division, Burmeister ultimately assigns his twenty-six musico-rhetorical figures to three different categories, with the last one deriving conceptually from the other two: *figurae harmoniae* (harmonic figures)*, melodiae* (melodic figures)*,* and *tam harmoniae quam melodiae* (harmonic-melodic figures). The first type,

---

[20] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 97–98.

[21] Joachim Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* edited by Claude Palisca, translation and introduction by Benito V. Rivera (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 56.

[22] See Burmeister, *Musical Poetics*, and Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 97.

[23] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* xvii. According to Pseudo-Cicero, "to confer distinction upon style is to render it ornate, embellishing it by variety. The divisions under distinction are figures of diction and figures of thought." Pseudo-Cicero, *Ad Herennium,* 4.13.18., quoted in Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* xvii.

harmonic figures, is applied to all voices of a composition and affects the entire structure (called "sentence" in rhetorical speech and *harmonia* in music, according to Burmeister)*.* The second division, melodic figures, pertains to individual voices and constitutes the melody (corresponding to "words" in rhetorical speech); unlike sentence / *harmonia,* it does not alter the entire structure. The last category, harmonic-melodic figures, is used in more than one voice. As Burmeister explains, this division of figures "transforms only individual voices through identical structuring."[24] The twenty-six figures can be seen in the following table:[25]

---

[24] For a complete list of all Burmeister's figures that includes those featured in his other two treatises, see Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* intro by Rivera, xxxviii–xlv.

[25] Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* 155–89.

Table 1: Burmeister's Musico-Rhetorical Figures from *Musica Poetica* (1606)

Main Category	Figure	Musical Definition	Rhetorical Definition
Figurae Harmoniae	*Fuga realis*	Imitation in all voices	No equivalence
	Metalepsis	Double fugue (with two subjects)	When a word is exchanged for a cause or effect
	Hypallage	Fugue with inversion – several voices	Inversion of the word order
	Apocope	Incomplete fugue in all voices	Cutting of a letter or a syllable
	Noema	Homophonic section for text declamation	Word derived from a commonplace
	Mimesis	*Noema* in some parts	Imitation of someone's characteristics (*ethopoiia*)
	Analepsis	Repeated *noema* on the same scale degree	*Epanalepsis* – repetition of a word at the beginning of a verse
	Anadiplosis	Repeated *mimesis*	Duplication of a word occurring at the end of a preceding verse and at the beginning of the next
	Symblema	Passing tone on a weak beat	Means "joining;" No equivalence
	Syncopa / syneresis	Dissonant syncopation on a strong beat	Cutting the middle of a word
	Pleonasmus	Combination of *symblema* and *syneresis;* Increase of syncopations before a cadence	Excess; burdening of the style with superfluidity of words
	Auxesis	Increase of number of voices and heightening of pitch with repetition of text	A word that exceeds the meaning; exaggeration
	Pathopoeia	Use of semitones foreign to a key	Variety of affections
	Hypotyposis	Enlivening of a particular word or section of text	Recounting of an event as if it was before one's eyes
	Aposiopesis	General pause	Becoming silent; some sentence is cut off
	Anaploke	Repetition of a short section by a second choir	*Ploke* – repetition of a word for a special meaning

Table 1 (cont.)

Main Category	Figure	Musical Definition	Rhetorical Definition
Figurae Melodiae	*Parembole*	Two or more voices with a point of imitation, while another is free	*Parenthesis* – something inserted in a sentence as an explanation
	Climax / Klimax	Repetition of a melodic fragment on another scale degree (that is, sequence)	*Gradatio* – proceeding gradually from one to another word, repeating the last
	Parrhesia	Passing 4th or 7th	*Licentia* – Freer personality in the form of a superior to remind them of something
	Hyperbole	Overstepping of modal ambitus, upper register	Hyperbole
	Hypobole	Overstepping of modal ambitus, lower register	No equivalence in treatises
Figurae tam Harmoniae quam Melodiae	*Congeries*	Succession 5-6-5-6 3-3-3-3	Several ideas piled up
	Fauxbourdon	Fauxbourdon	No equivalence
	Anaphora	Imitation in some but not all voices	Same word at the beginning of several verses for emphasis
	Fuga imaginaria	Canon	No equivalence

Although it is not feasible to provide here an in-depth analysis of all Burmeister's musico-rhetorical figures, two cases should suffice to exemplify the theorist's approach. The first is *apocope,* which is a *harmonia figura.* In its most simple, literal sense, it means "a cutting off." In Classical rhetoric, it represents the cutting of a letter or a syllable—*Achilli*, instead of *Achillis,* or *do* instead of *doma.*[26] The verbatim meaning is reflected in both musical and (speech) rhetorical figures: in the former sense, it refers to a shortening of the final note in a voice or in a (quasi-)fugue, resulting in an incomplete fugue. According to Burmeister, *apocope* is a "fugue that is not completed in all the voices. Instead, its subject, interrupted mid-fugue, is cut off in one voice for some reason, as in the *exordium* of Orlando di Lasso's five voices *Legem pone mihi Domine.*"[27] As seen in example 1, the first

---

[26] Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* 163–65. Rivera provides the explanations of all the corresponding Classical rhetoric definitions in the pages indicated.
[27] Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* 163–65.

three voices follow one after the other in points of imitation, until the word "*mihi:*"[28]

Example 1: Burmeister's *Apocope* in Orlando di Lasso's *Legem pone mihi,* mm. 1–4

Burmeister's *apocope* in this context signifies the "unfinished composition / fugue." Although other German theorists have used this musical figure (such as Joachim Thuringus [(b. late sixteenth century), *Opuscullum*] and Johann Gottfried Walther [(1684–1748), *Lexicon*]), Burmeister applies it in a fugal context while continuing to use a terminology derived from figures of speech. As indicated by Bartel, the theorist's concern to identify a specific musical device with a (speech) rhetorical name is evident, although he adjusts the rhetorical definitions to fit the musical framework.[29]

Other examples of Burmeister's adoption of speech terms to musical figures are the *hyperbole* and *hypobole,* which are *figurae melodiae* (melodic figures). The former, a "throwing beyond" or "overshooting" in the literal sense is "an acceptable overstatement of the truth," in Quintilianus's words.[30] The opposite, *hypobole,* stands for "throwing or putting under" and, although it rarely appears in Latin treatises as a rhetorical figure, it refers to an "understatement of the truth." Again, Burmeister adjusts a Classical figure of speech to a musical device by ascribing a connotation of upward or downward direction based on the prefixes "hyper" and "hypo." Thus, *hyperbole* in this context means "pushing a melody up beyond its upper boundary" of the mode, whereas *hypobole* "is pressing a melody down beyond

---

[28] This example is taken from Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* 258–59. The text in the original reads as follows: *"Legem pone mihi Domine viam justificationum tuarum et exquiram eam semper"* here translated to English by Rivera, *Musical Poetics,* 258–59: "Set before me for a law the way of thy justifications, O Lord: and I will always seek after it."

[29] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* trans. Rivera, 201.

[30] Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* 183. See Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 306 for the reference on Quintilianus (*Institutio* VIII.vi.67).

the bottom limit of its *ambitus.*" Burmeister provides examples of this using, once more, Orlando di Lasso's works.[31] For the case of *hypobole,* the excerpt provided below comes from the composer's motet *In transietum* in the words *"dereliquit me virtus mea."* It occurs more precisely on the word "*mea*" in the bass voice, reaching a fifth beyond the bottom of the Hypophrygian ambitus, as seen in the following excerpt:[32]

Example 2: Burmeister's *Hypobole* in Orlando di Lasso's excerpt from *In transietum,* mm. 43–46

In sum, *hyper-* and *hypobole* signify a transgression of the range or ambitus of a mode. As Bartel indicates, "Burmeister's *hyperbole* and *hypobole* illustrate his intention to provide familiar musical devices with rhetorical terminology, even if the accompanying rhetorical definitions are not applicable."[33] The literal meaning of the terms in Classical rhetoric is what determines the theorist's choice of nomenclature in music.

Burmeister is not the only one making the association between musico-rhetorical figures and the transgression of a mode's ambitus, i.e., changing between plagal and authentic: theorists such as Herbst (mentioned earlier in this article) addressed similar issues, although ascribing different names. In the latter's case, he adopts the term *licentia,* while Burmeister uses *hyperbole* or *hypobole,* and Bernhard chooses, instead, the nomenclature *mutatio toni* (i.e., an

---

[31] Burmeister, *Musical Poetics*, 183.
[32] Example in Burmeister, *Musical Poetics,* 297. Rivera's translation reads as follows: "…My heart pounds, my strength fails me, my pain is ever with me…"
[33] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 304.

irregular alteration of the mode) when discussing some voices that either do not fulfill the mode (*modus deficiens*) or exceed it (*modus superfluus*).[34] The main difference between Burmeister and other theorists such as Schonsleder, however, is that the former does not explicitly refer to or explain the affective potential of these expressive figures.[35]

Wolfgang Schonsleder's *Architectonice Musices: Verba Affectuum*

Approaching the second half of the seventeenth century, German theorists aimed to further explain the mechanism through which music affected the passions of its listeners. Gradually, music was no longer mainly a reflection of the meaning of texts, but its emphasis became increasingly more on moving [*movere / flectere*] the audience to emotional states called affections, affects, or passions. It is widely known that these came to be systematically codified in the mid-seventeenth century by René Descartes in *Les Passions de l'âme* (1649), expanded a year after by Kircher in *Musurgia Universale* (1650).[36] However, the Jesuit rhetorical tradition and its categories of main *affectus* have earlier origins, as is evident in Schonsleder's treatise *Architectonice musices universalis* (1631) published two decades prior.[37] He followed the affect categories of Carlo Reggio's *Orator Christianus* (1612), as seen in the following table:[38]

---

[34] Bartel, *Musica Poetica*, 305. See Bernhard, *Tractatus compositionis augmentatus* (ca. 1657), chapter 44, p. 91, quoted in Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 305.

[35] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 305*.*

[36] Descartes studied several years in the Jesuit school *La Flèche*; for more information regarding his background and Jesuit education, see Alfredo Gatto, "Descartes and the Jesuits," in *Jesuit Philosophy on the Eve of Modernity,* ed. by C. Casalini (Boston-Leiden: Brill, 2019), 405–25.
See Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 36–39 for further discussions on "Affections and Temperaments," as well as on Kircher. In the same pages, Bartel writes the following: "Kircher was a German Jesuit and fanner professor of sciences working in Rome. His work is a far more detailed and comprehensive tome than Descartes's, incorporating all facets of musical interest. Kircher devoted much of his *Musurgia* to the subject of *musica pathetica*, discussed at great length in the chapter entitled 'How the harmonic numbers arouse the affections.' The desire to link mathematics, and the closely related discipline of medicine, with rhetoric is unmistakable, now in conjunction with the teachings of the four temperaments and humors.

[37] Wolfgang Schonsleder studied with Orlando di Lasso, whose works were frequently used as examples in Burmeister's *Musica Poetica.*

[38] See Pietro Cerone and Wolfgang Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation*, Di Sandro (ed.), 12–13, where a comparative list of both Kircher and Schonsleder's *affectus* are displayed side by side (table compiled by Di Sandro and translated by Júlia Coelho in *Musical Interpretation*).

Table 2: Affects in Jesuit Rhetorical Tradition: Carlo Reggio and Schonsleder

Main Affects in the Jesuit Rhetorical Tradition (Carlo Reggio, *Orator Christianus*, 1612)	Schonsleder's Examples (*Architectonice musices universalis*, 1631)
Love–Complacency (*Amor–complacentia*)	Religious devotion (*Pietas*); Sweetness (*Dulcedo*)
Desire (*Desiderium*)	To seek (*Quaerere*); Clamor (*Clamor*)
Joy–Delight (*Gaudium–Laetitia*)	To rejoice (*Gaudere*); Dance (*Saltatio*); To laugh (*Ridere*); Foolishness (*Stultitia*); To play (*Ludere*)
Pain–Sadness (*Dolor–Tristitia*)	Sigh (*Suspirum*); Harshness (*Duritia*); Sadness (*Tristitia*); Languor (*Languor*); Patience (*Patientia*); Senile Boredom (*Taedium senile*)
Pity (*Misericordia*)	Pity (*Misericordia*); Tears (*Lacrymae*)
Courage–Confidence (*Audacia–Confidentia*)	To urge (*Invitare*); To incite (*Excitare*); To fight (Certare)
Fear (*Timor*); Stupor (*Stupor*); Wonder (*Admiratio*)	Fear-Anguish (*Timor-Angustia*); Agitation (*Turbatio*); Coldness (*Frigor*); Wonder (*Admiratio*)
Anger (*Ira*)	Anger (*Iracundia*); Contempt (*Contemptio*); Terrible (*Terribilis*)

In his treatise, Schonsleder was particularly interested in the expression of affects, which he defined as "maximum ornament;" in his words, they consist of adapting "melodies to the affective content of the words," instead of framing them from a Classical rhetoric angle.[39] Contrary to Burmeister's prescriptive methodology, offering a list of figures that originated from Classical rhetoric, Schonsleder prefers an inductive approach of showing "by example, rather than by

---

[39] Schonsleder writes the following: "*Maximum ornamentum est verbis eorumque affectibus accommodate modulos,*" in Schonsleder, *Architectonice Musices universalis ex qua melopoeam per universa et solida fundamenta musicorum, propria marte eondiscere possi* (Ingolstadt: Wilhelm Eder, 1631)*,* 32, quoted in Massimo Di Sandro, "Introduction," in Cerone and Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation,* 6.

rules."[40] Schonsleder presents a series of passages taken mainly from Lasso's motets, always showing how different melodic, harmonic, and rhythmic elements correspond to the emotion evoked by the text.[41]

Not only does Schonsleder emphasize the affective aspect as descriptive—seen as well in Kircher's work twenty years later—but he also expands these ideas beyond just affects. He also lists depictions of actions, references to time, as well as quantity. As seen below, these categories can be divided as follows:[42]

Table 3: Schonsleder's Categories of Text Depiction

Affects / Affections	Joy, Fear, Sadness, Harshness, Glad, Rejoice, Weep, Fear, Shout, Sympathize With, Regret, Plead, Get Angry, Laugh, Commiserate
Motion and place	Stay, Jump, Run, Ascend, Calm Down, Climb, Lift, Throw, Descend, Heaven, Abyss, Mountains, Deep, High
Time and quantity	Quickly, Slowly, Late, Twice, Rapidly, Promptly, In the Morning, Repeatedly, Often, Rarely, Day, Night
Person's Life Stages	Infant, Child, Old Age, With Their Typical Behaviors: Humility, Disdain, Cowardice, Pride, Hatred

When analyzing both Kircher's and Schonsleder's treatises, it becomes evident that the former is much closer to Schonsleder than to other German theorists of their time. This similarity can be explained because both were part of the order of Jesuits, "whose ways of teaching and practicing rhetoric focused special attention on the analysis of emotions and on the techniques used to create them in the audience," according to Di Sandro.[43]

---

[40] Di Sandro (ed.), "Introduction," *Musical Interpretation,* 6.

[41] See Di Sandro, "Introduction," *Musical Interpretation,* 6–8.

[42] This list was not made by Schonsleder but compiled by Di Sandro, then translated and made into a table by Júlia Coelho in Di Sandro, "Introduction," *Musical Interpretation,* 8.

[43] Di Sandro, "Introduction," *Musical Interpretation,* 11. On this topic, see Andrea Battistini, "I manuali di retorica dei gesuiti," in *La 'Ratio Studiorum.' Modelli culturalli e pratiche educative dei Gesuiti in Italia tra Cinque e Seicento,* ed. Gian Paolo Brizzi (Rome: Bulzoni, 1981), 77–120.

An example of Schonsleder that depicts an affect is "patience," which can be seen in the example below with the text "Be silent willingly, endure patiently:"[44]

Example 3: Schonsleder's "Patience" (*Patientia*) in Orlando di Lasso's *Tace libenter*

The mournful succession D4–E♭4–D4 (mm. 3 and 5, which also appears later in other voices), obstructs each time the rest of the harmony in the cadence and receives a particular emphasis. Later in the piece, the succession of three cadences designed in this way and an evaded cadence in the bass—after an illusory gesture of closure—create a "saturation effect" that ends in the strong final cadence: in this example, patience represents in music the capacity to tolerate the delay of a well-shaped and complete cadence.[45] The chain of

---

[44] Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation,* 60–61.

[45] On expectation of completeness, see Leonard Meyer, *Emotion and Meaning in Music* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), 135–38 and 143–56.

syncopations on the word "*patienter*" (patiently), accompanied in the lower voices by a descending parallel motion, depicts the idea of languor and forms a cadential process that Nucius describes as *commissura*.[46] The reiteration of this formula sets the lamenting tone for the entire passage.

Another example of an affect that Schonsleder explores is "harshness," with the Italian text "*Signor io t'ho confitto su questa dura croce*" ["Lord, I nailed thee to this harsh cross"], seen in the example below:[47]

Example 4: Schonsleder's "Harshness (*Duritia*)" in Jacob Peeters's *Signor io t'ho confitto*

In this excerpt, the "sharpness of the pain—physical in this case—is expressed with a *dura* harmony (harsh):"[48] the harshness comes from a succession of two major sixth intervals in mm. 2–3 (G3–B4 and F3–D4) of example 4 on the words "*t'ho confitto*" ["I nailed thee"] and two (non-consecutive) major sixths on the word "*dura* (*croce*)" ["harsh (cross)"] in mm. 5–6 (G3–E4 and F3–D4). As the word "*dura"* appears, the process appears dilated, as to express the prolonged suffering, and meanders from the fioriture doubled in those measures. It is important to indicate that Schonsleder follows Zarlino's idea of a harmonic major sixth as a *dura* harmony, particularly when combined with a suspended fourth that resolves, respectively, to a sixth and to a third.[49] Other than the suspended fourth, the major-sixth gesture is accompanied by yet another indicator of *duritia:* a suspended augmented fourth (F3–B4) that resolves to a 5/3 chord in mm. 2–3.[50]

---

[46] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 419.

[47] Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation,* 86. The score and figured bass are according to Di Sandro's edition.

[48] Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation,* 86*.*

[49] See Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation,* 86, and Gioseffo Zarlino, *Le Istitutioni Harmoniche: nelle quali oltra le materie appartenenti alla musica,* chapter 66 (Venice: Francesco Senese, 1561), 263.

[50] Schonsleder, *Musical Interpretation,* 86.

The tritone F–B between the outer voices brings forth, even more, the harshness affect and effect; furthermore, the false relation C#4/C5 in m. 2 underlines the harshness highly suggested by the text.

The choice of these examples, their title and classifications of affect, as well as the explanations applied to both affect and music that Schonsleder provides, demonstrate that the emphasis is placed on the affective aspect. Rather than following Classical rhetorical principles and terminology as done by Burmeister, Schonsleder underlines affective features in more than thirty musical examples in his *Architectonice Musices.*

Christopher Bernhard's Dissonance, *Stylus,* and Affect: Between German and Italian Theories

A text that suggests harshness offers undoubtedly considerable dramatic potential; although not using the same term "*duritia"* as Schonsleder to represent harshness*,* Bernhard addresses this particular affect (and many others) in his *Tractatus compositionis augmentatus* (1647). Unlike Schonsleder, however, Bernhard represents a bridge between German Lutheran tradition and aspects of the Italian *seconda prattica:* he helped adapt *Figurenlehre* to the newer Italian styles through his influence from Italy due to his documented trips and studies with Giacomo Carissimi and Lutheran composer Heinrich Schütz.[51]

Bernhard is a highly influential figure in adapting the concept of *elocutio* in terms of identifying and defining compositional techniques. During a time when the solo vocal repertoire exerts increasing significance, Bernhard offers a different perspective on the theories of musico-rhetorical figures: instead of Burmeister's intent of identifying devices of musical *ornatus* based on Classical rhetoric, or Schonsleder's direct correlation between the figures and the affections or actions, Bernhard establishes *style* as the principle of his classification system and aims to explain and legitimize dissonance in musico-rhetorical figures as a compositional device to express affect.[52]

In his *Tractatus*, Bernhard provides the following definition: "[a figure is] a certain way of employing dissonances, which renders these not only inoffensive but rather quite agreeable, bringing the skill of the composer to the light of day."[53] Instead of classifying his figures according to Classical terms or affects and actions, Bernhard chooses to do so following the various styles of contrapuntal composition, with

---

[51] Heinrich Schütz met and studied with Claudio Monteverdi in Venice in 1628.

[52] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 113.

[53] Bernhard, *Tractatus compositionis augmentatus* (1647)*,* ch. 16, §3, p. 77, quoted in Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 113.

a particular emphasis on dissonance, as mentioned above. Of the three styles, one is called *stylus gravis / antiquus,* which are notes that do not move too quickly, and with few kinds of dissonance treatment. A second category is *stylus modernus / luxurians communis*, consisting of rather quick notes and strange leaps that are well suited to stir affections and imply more kinds of dissonance treatment. Lastly, *stylus* (*luxurians*) *treatralis* are dissonances that are often required to express the text, and it is meant to represent speech in music.[54] As McCreless points out, one of the advantages of Bernhard's system compared to Burmeister's is its organization based on "contrapuntal treatments that acquire[s] meaning precisely because [it] represent[s] the expressive ornamentation of a specific figure in the simpler *stylus gravis,* such as the embellished *stylus recitativus* that offers multiple figures." There is a clear correlation between *stylus gravis* and *prima prattica* as legitimate styles *per se*, and not simply "unornamented" music in the context of German *musica poetica.*[55]

Bernhard's initial classification of the figures according to compositional styles is modelled after the Italian stylistic taxonomies of Marco Scacchi (1600–1662), who divided the threefold system of vocal styles, from the most conservative to the most progressive, into *stylus ecclesiasticus, cubicularis,* and *scenicus seu theatralis* (*lit*.: church, chamber, and theatrical styles).[56] The following table displays the different figures according to the three styles in Bernhard's system, together with their ascribed meaning:[57]

Table 4: Bernhard's Figures from his *Tractatus compositionis augmentatus* (1660)

Style	Figure	Meaning
Stylus gravis/ antiquus	*Transitus*	Passing tone on a weak beat
	Quasi-Transitus	Passing tone on a strong beat
	Syncopatio (ligatura)	Suspension
	Quasi-Syncopatio	Note repeated on strong beat

---

[54] See Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 114–16.

[55] McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 863–64.

[56] Scacchi included the ecclesiastical style and excluded dance in his system. See Vicente Casanova de Almeida, "A tradição platônica no *Breve Discorso Sopra la Musica Moderna* de Marco Scacchi (1649)," *Ars Historica: Historiografia e Estudo do Oitocentos* XI (December 2015), 37–54.

[57] See Bartel, "Christoph Bernhard," in *Musica Poetica,* 112–19.

Table 4 (cont.)

Style	Figure	Meaning
	Superjectio	Upper Neighbor
	Anticipatio notae	Anticipation
	Subsumptio	Lower escape tone
	Variatio	Long note decorated with shorter notes (*passaggio*)
	Multiplicatio	Repetition of a dissonant note
	Prolongatio	Figure where a dissonance has a longer duration than the preceding note
	Syncopatio catachrestica	Ornamented resolution of suspension
	Passus duriusculus	Rise or fall of a chromatic semitone
Stylus luxurians modernus/ communis	*Saltus duriusculus*	Use of large or dissonant leaps not used in *stylus gravis*
	Mutatio toni	Mixing of modes, either with authentic or plagal in the same voice, or going from one mode to another in composition
	Incoatio imperfecta	Beginning a composition with a dissonant interval
	Longiqua distantia	Wide separation of one voice from another
	Quaestitio notae	Cutting off the end of a note in order to seek the next note from a lower neighbor
	Cadentiae duriusculae	Unusual dissonances before final two notes of a cadence

Table 4 (cont.)

Style	Figure	Meaning
Stylus luxurians theatralis	*Extensio*	Extreme lengthening of a dissonance
	Mora	Inverted resolution of a suspension
	Ellipsis	Suppression of a typically required consonance
	Abruptio	Breaking off of a vocal line instead of achieving expected consonant resolution
	Transitus inversus	Situation in recitative in which passing dissonance is on the strong beat or part of the measure
	Heterolepsis	Leap into another voice

From this table, it becomes clear that none of Burmeister's original terminology survives and that musico-rhetorical theory was becoming increasingly more a musico-theoretical language, rather than relying on verbal rhetoric for organizing principles and identifying main categories. By Bernhard's time, the context of German Baroque *musica poetica* was leaning towards a synthesis of the styles instead of a rather distinct separation between them, which would allow the "Lutheran *musica poetica* greater versatility and effectiveness in expressing the text through the music," as Bartel indicates.[58]

Bernhard places his theory of musico-rhetorical figures in the context of the stylistic trends of the mid-seventeenth century—including vocal music—all the while without breaking bonds with the past. In contrast with the previous theorists, Bernhard focuses on explaining and legitimizing dissonance in a piece through musico-rhetorical figures in relationship to affect, while analyzing the new musical styles that were emerging during his time. He eventually revises his three-fold division of styles in his *Ausführlicher Bericht vom Gebrauche der Con- und Dissonantien* and reduces it to only two: *stylus gravis* (*stylus antiquus*) and *stylus luxurians* (*stylus modernus*), which is an even clearer reference to Italian *prima* and *seconda prattica* distinctions. In his system, Bernhard demonstrates the relationship between the expressive or dissonant devices of the *modernus* style

---

[58] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 117.

and the concepts of the *gravis,* while providing the composer with expressive figures that communicate a text *affectively*—including in the context of Lutheran music.[59]

The excerpts of Schütz's work that were chosen by Bernhard—particularly the German large sacred concerto *Saul* and its piece "Saul, was verfolgst du mich?"—serve as exemplary combinations of these qualities: treatment of dissonance, Italian style, and a Lutheran input. This sacred concerto was written during the Thirty Years' War and reflected the Lutherans' principles of spreading the Word during a time of religious conflict with the Catholics; the dramatic potential of this piece is explored in depth by the composer—including in its dissonance treatment and how it accentuates the same affect discussed by Schonsleder: harshness.

From the several harmonic and intervallic-related musical figures identified by Bernhard, two are particularly relevant to explain the relationship between dissonance and affect: the *cadentiae duriusculae* and the *saltus duriusculus.* The first figure ("harsh cadential note") consists of a dissonance in the antepenultimate cadential harmony: [60]

> *Cadentiae duriusculae* are cadences in which some rather strange dissonances precede the final two notes. Such cadences occur almost exclusively in vocal solos and are most often found in arias and in triple meter sections. Should they occur in polyphonic works, however, the other voices must be set in such a manner that they do not allow any sense of disagreement.

In this case, the dissonances shown in the following example render the harshness of Jesus's word "*verfolgst*" (persecution) with a *cadentia duriuscula*, repeated throughout the piece in the solo / duets parts, with the text "Saul, why do you persecute me?," as shown in the following example:[61]

---

[59] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 118.

[60] Bernhard, *Tractatus,* quoted in Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 214.

[61] This example is taken from J. Peter Burkholder, Donald Jay Grout, and Claude V. Palisca*, Norton Anthology of Western Music*, Vol. 1 (New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 2019), 596–607.

Example 5: Bernhard's *Cadentiae duriusculae* in Schütz's "Saul, was verfolgst du mich?" mm. 1–5

The same idea of harshness is conveyed shortly after in the same piece, this time with the *saltus duriusculus,* that is, a use of large or dissonant leaps not used in *stylus gravis,* as seen in the following example in the words "zu lökken": [62]

Example 6: Bernhard's *Saltus duriusculus* in Schütz's "Saul, was verfolgst du mich?" mm. 24–28

The *cadentiae duriusculae,* as demonstrated in Ex. 5, are formed by a dissonant structure, that is, an unusual dissonance occurring before the final notes of a cadence. In the example above, the G minor harmony is presented with a D3 and E3 above it in the soloist voices (*bassus I* and *II*), creating a 6/5 chord. When the bass moves from a G2 to an A2, but the solo voices maintain their clashing upper notes, a sustained fourth is created, with now a 5/4 above the bass. As the E3 and D3 descend by step and half-step accordingly, a D3 against a C#3 takes place instead, with the D working as a suspension, creating a 4/3 chord. The anticipation of the D3 only resolves to the D chord in m. 5 after the 6/5–5/4–4/3 progression takes place on the words "verfolgst du" with E3/D3 and D3/C#3 dissonances, creating the

---

[62] Heinrich Schütz, "Saul, was verfolgst du mich?," in *Norton Anthology,* 596–607*.*

cadentia duriuscula. As stated by Bartel, this musico-rhetorical figure can only be encountered in Bernhard's *Tractatus.* Although it expresses the idea of harshness / *duritia* that was already discussed by Schonsleder, the latter did not place an emphasis on the treatment of dissonances. Bernhard's concern to legitimize its use, considered inadmissible in the *stylus gravis,* leads to his discussion of dissonance as a crucial device to express affect.[63]

After German *Musica Poetica*: What Follows? From Its Peak to Its Decline

There is no doubt that rhetoric still played a crucial role in the eighteenth-century theoretical systems after *musica poetica.* Rhetoric itself was still an essential part of German schools' education, but the Reformation theology and humanism-based principles became less prominent, whereas the rational and Enlightenment ideals were growing strong during this period. After the eighteenth-century deviation from the strict, prescriptive Classical rhetoric rules as used by Burmeister, music's primary expressive goal became the acquisition of a musical unity that would be "based on a rationalized concept of emotions called the *affections*," as scholar George Buelow summarizes.[64] The tradition of German musico-rhetorical figures that was based on *elocutio* (i.e., mastery of stylistic elements and the third canon of classical rhetoric) changed by Mattheson's time.

As with his contemporaries, Mattheson's approach to this tradition is marked by a shift from *elocutio* and musical figures (central in the concept of *music poetica* of the seventeenth century) to, instead, *inventio* and *dispositio*; he discusses how *loci topici* inspire melodic ideas and expresses a deeper interest towards musical form. He describes then different parts of a melody by using the six *dispositio* parts (*Exordium, narratio, propositio, confirmatio, confutatio,* and *peroratio* [introduction, report, discourse, corroboration, confutation, and conclusion]), but the emphasis in this case was not on the verbal rhetoric and, instead, on the form. By the eighteenth century, the attention in rhetoric became increasingly focused on its metaphorical use to guide the shape of musical form, instead of a fundamental (and literal) criterion like it was with Burmeister. Therefore, by Mattheson's time, it becomes obsolete to continue associating musico-rhetorical elements to their *musica poetica* or *Figurenlehren* roots, becoming incompatible with the new *stile Galant* or *Empfindsamkeit* aesthetics.[65]

By the eighteenth century, the principles of Classical rhetoric applied to music were reevaluated and used more in a metaphorical sense, in contrast with how Burmeister applied them with his musico-

---

[63] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 213.

[64] Buelow, "Johann Mattheson and the inventio of the *Affektenlehre*," 396.

[65] McCreless, "Music and Rhetoric," 870.

rhetorical figures. These principles were thus used more selectively and, by consequence, multiple new analogies became possible. This is evident in how Mattheson perceived models of musical organization. As scholar Peter Hoyt explains,[66]

> Whereas Dressler and Burmeister had only been willing to create three-part models of musical organization (using rhetorical concepts in dividing the work roughly into beginning, middle, and end), Mattheson advanced a detailed comparison of the da capo aria to the six-part oration. This analogy required, among other liberties, that the opening ritornello appears as both the *exordium* and the *peroratio*, despite the very different functions these two components serve in traditional rhetorical theory. Mattheson justified this departure from the *ars oratorio* simply by referring to the repetition as a musical convention.

This use of rhetoric represents a new development in the relationship between rhetoric and music: Mattheson and many of his contemporaries regarded musical conventions as taking precedence because "rhetoric no longer exerted priority over music," as neither did harmony prevail over melody nor instrumental over vocal (according to his theory), which reflected the aesthetic changes of this period.[67] Nevertheless, music and rhetoric to Mattheson still shared common goals, methodologies, expressive devices, and principles that were equally applicable in both fields, as Bartel indicates.[68] It is in search of this concept of *expressive devices* that the German theorist and other contemporaries sought a balance between melody and rhetoric in order to better *express* the affections. By the eighteenth century, the ultimate goal of music became the expression of affect, an idea that started to slowly germinate with its gradual emphasis in the mid-seventeenth century with Schonsleder, Kircher, and Bernhard.

Conclusion

The plurality of approaches, principles, outcomes, and framework in the different seventeenth-century *musica poetica* systems here analyzed are the reason why I consider "*Theories* of musico-rhetorical figures" a more fitting term instead of coining it

---

[66] George Buelow, Blake Wilson, and Peter Hoyt, "Rhetoric and Music."
[67] Buelow, Wilson, and Hoyt, "Rhetoric and Music*.*" On melody, see Mattheson, "On the Art of Creating a Good Melody, *Der Vollkommene Capellmeister*, 469. On instrumental *vs.* vocal music, he states that "the first difference [...] between a vocal and instrumental melody, consists in the fact that the former is, so to speak, the mother, but the latter is her daughter [...]." Mattheson, *Der Vollkommene Capellmeister,* 418–19.
[68] Bartel, *Musica Poetica,* 143.

under the guise of a uniform "Theory" during this time. The latter proves to not represent a unified system, with an emphasis either on literal Classical rhetoric terms and Lutheranism (as with Burmeister), on the *affective* aspect with a Jesuitic point of view (as adopted by Schonsleder), or on the dissonance as the main compositional device for affect expression, within both a Lutheran framework and Italian influence (as in Bernhard's approach).

Burmeister's work on *musica poetica*, coming from a Lutheran *Lateinschule* context, was undoubtedly vital in incorporating rhetorical aspects into the music. Most of Burmeister's terminology was eventually abandoned by other theorists, although the rhetorical concept applied to music did survive in a mostly revised, re-considered, and expanded form throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries—as seen with the other theorists here discussed. One can observe that these other theories were shaped by different criteria, influences, and methodologies, compared to Burmeister's prescriptive school of thought: among these distinctions are the inductive approach and affect-based theory rooted in the Jesuit tradition with Schonsleder, and the Italian tradition mixed with Lutheran origins, as in the case of Bernhard. The latter's criterion in *musica poetica* was based on dissonance treatment to express *affect,* a pivotal term in the "post-*musica poetica*" period with Mattheson and his contemporaries in the eighteenth century. Despite the manifest differences between the positions of Burmeister, Schonsleder, and Bernhard, there are commonalities between their theories and a great attention to rhetoric's potential expressive role in musical composition, as well as their view on what a figure represents: an irregular and artful manner utilized to depict and enhance musical expression.

Selected Bibliography:

Almeida, Vicente Casanova de. "A tradição platônica no *Breve Discorso Sopra la Musica Moderna* de Marco Scacchi (1649)," *Ars Historica: Historiografia e Estudo do Oitocentos* XI (December 2015): 37–54.

Bartel, Dietrich. *Musica Poetica: Musical-Rhetorical Figures in German Baroque Music*. Lincoln, NE; London: University of Nebraska Press, 2009.

Battistini, Andrea. "I manuali di retorica dei gesuiti," In *La 'Ratio Studiorum.' Modelli culturalli e pratiche educative dei Gesuiti in Italia tra Cinque e Seicento*, ed. Gian Paolo Brizzi, 77–120. Rome: Bulzoni, 1981.

Braunschweig, Karl. "Genealogy and 'Musica Poetica.' In Seventeenth-and Eighteenth-Century Theory," *Acta Musicologica* 73, No. 1 (2001): 45–75.

———. *Review-Essay of Dietrich Bartel, Musica Poetica,* by Dietrich Bartel. *Theoria* 9, No 1 (2001): 89–103.

Buelow, George. "Johann Mattheson and the inventio of the *Affektenlehre.*" In *New Mattheson Studies*, edited by George L. Buelow, and Hans Joachim Marx, 393–408. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986.

Burkholder, J. Peter, Donald Jay Grout, and Claude V. Palisca. *Norton Anthology of Western Music. Vol. 1*. New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 2019.

Burmeister, Joachim. *Musical Poetics,* ed. Claude Palisca, trans. and intro. Benito V. Rivera. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993.

Cerone, Petro, and Wolfgang Schonsleder. *Musical Interpretation of Text in Vocal Polyphony,* ed. Massimo Di Sandro, trans. Júlia Coelho. Avellino: Edizioni Pasitea, 2017.

Cicero, Marcus Tullius. *De oratore ad Quintum fratrem libri tres* (55 B.C.), ed. Lucas Robia and Filippo Giunta I. Florence: Ex officina Philippi Giuntae, 1514.

———. *On the Ideal Orator*, trans. James May and Jakob Wisse. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Dell'Antonio, Andrew. *Listening as Spiritual Practice in Early Modern Italy*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011.

Gatto, Alfredo. "Descartes and the Jesuits." In *Jesuit Philosophy on the Eve of Modernity*, ed. C. Casalini, 405–25. Boston-Leiden: Brill, 2019.

Mattheson, Johann, and Ernest Charles Harris (ed. and trans.). *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*. Ph.D. diss., George Peabody College for Teachers, 1969.

McCreless, Patrick. "Music and Rhetoric." In *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*, ed. Thomas Christensen, 847–79*.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Meyer, Leonard Bunce. *Emotion and Meaning in Music.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956.

Monteverdi, Claudio*. Lettere, dediche e prefazioni,* ed. Domenico De' Paoli. Rome: Edizioni De Santis, 1973.

Pecknold, Sara M. "Relics, Processions and the Sounding of Affections: Barbara Strozzi, the Archduchess of Innsbruck, and Saint Anthony of Padua," *Yale Journal of Music & Religion* 2, No. 2. (September 24, 2016): 77–94.

Quintilianus, Aristides. *Institutio oratoria*, 4 vols., trans. H. Butler. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 1920.

Schonsleder, Wolfgang. *Architectonice Musices universalis ex qua melopoeam per universa et solida fundamenta musicorum, propria marte eondiscere possis.* Ingolstadt: Wilhelm Eder, 1631.

Strunk, Oliver (ed.). *Source Readings: Classical Antiquity through Romantic*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1950.

Vickers, Brian. *In Defence of Rhetoric*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2002.

Zarlino, Gioseffo. *Le Istitutioni Harmoniche: nelle quali oltra le materie appartenenti alla musica*. Venice: Francesco Senese, 1561.

A Real Salsero: A Case Study in Denton's Salsa Dance Scene

STACEY KEY

It is Latin Night at the Cantina, hosted by Jairo "Jo" Rojas and his partner Lakyn Garza. The night opens with a twenty- or thirty-minute lesson presenting a simple salsa or bachata pattern, after which the floor is open to any wishing to dance. Salsa and bachata songs dominate the soundscape but are interspersed with merengue and reggaeton so that anyone can find a song to dance to. Latin Night is a time when seasoned dancers and newcomers come together over a shared love of salsa and bachata dancing. It is also a night where locals and visitors can come together to share moves, experiences, and relax. The Cantina is a good place for drinking as well as dancing, and on Latin Nights, dancers and non-dancing patrons fill the space. Seated at tables or around the bar, some patrons observe and remark on the dancing while others focus on their drinks and companions. The difference between patron and dancer is marked—patrons tend to stay at their tables while dancers move easily between the floor and bar. Dancers of Hispanic, Caucasian, and African American ethnicities fill the space, along with those of numerous other backgrounds. Despite English being the common language, the dancers speak to each other using their bodies.

Most, if they are looking to dance, stand or sit at tables by the edge of the floor, facing out toward those already on the dance floor. Body language speaks volumes for those in attendance; turning towards the floor, actively making eye contact with other dancers, and moving with the music generally indicate a readiness to dance, if one can find a partner. Facing away from the floor, keeping one's distance from the dancing, or avoiding direct eye contact with dancers may speak of fatigue from a previous dance or a dislike of the current song. As they move together on the floor, dancers' bodies speak at a different volume. Close contact between partners, lingering gazes, and smiles say one thing; frowns, eyes focused on something in the distance, and little body contact say something else entirely. The first indicates that the partners are comfortable, relaxed, and enjoying themselves, while the second speaks to discomfort or unfamiliarity, a desire to maintain separation, and displeasure. Whether consciously or unconsciously, much of the communication at Mulberry Cantina is non-verbal. In such a setting, the body can not only function as a means of communication, but as a sign or measure of authenticity.

Dancers rarely speak using only their bodies, however. When not dancing, I often sit or stand near dancers from Jo's group and listen to their observations of the event. As I took a break from dancing one night, a woman next to me nodded towards a small, dark-skinned man who had just entered and remarked that he was a good dancer, but hard to follow. She was not terribly fond of dancing with him, she said,

because he seemed to dance a different style of salsa than she did; this, she assumed, was because he was from somewhere in the Caribbean. I recalled other dancers making similar remarks, both about this man and others from outside of the United States, and was surprised by what I heard. Wasn't 'real salsa' found in the home countries of these dancers? Or are there elements in the dance itself that lead to hierarchies? If Joanna Bosse (2013) was right and choosing a partner was all about authenticity, then why were dancers here reluctant to choose these guardians of authentic salsa? Who decided what made a dancer authentic, anyway? Questions of authenticity, ethnicity, and what "real" salsa is to the dancers at the Mulberry Cantina raced through my mind, prompting me to dive into this "real thing" known as salsa.

The "Real Thing"

Born in New York City under the careful control of Fania Records in the 1960s,[1] salsa music combined Cuban *son* with genres such as Latin jazz and Puerto Rican *plenads* to create a pan-Latin music that has become symbolic of Latin identity. This identity is problematic, contested, with many arguing that it is an essentially Cuban or Puerto Rican genre, and tying both the music and dance to perceptions of racial identity as a signifier of authenticity (here understood as training in regionally specific styles of salsa dancing and the accompanying display of skill and cultural competency). This practice of racializing salsa dance thus excludes numerous identities and participants regardless of their perceived or actual ethnic identity, cultural affiliation, or skill level. Despite the interconnected nature of salsa music and dance, questions of authenticity in salsa as a cultural phenomenon is too complex a topic for this paper. As such, I have chosen to focus on salsa dance as the nexus for questioning ideas of authenticity among professional dancers and teachers in the North Texas area and its place in their performance praxis. Novice dancers and scholars often connect authenticity to either ethnicity or to *latinidad*, a sense of Latin identity based upon shared social, linguistic, and geopolitical ties or an identity imposed from without and shaped within Latinx communities.[2] However, the structured interviews presented here, along with anecdotal evidence and personal experience, reveal that dancers in the Denton salsa dance community[3] tend to connect authenticity to personal bodily

---

[1] Sydney Hutchinson, "Dancing in Place: An Introduction," in *Salsa World: a global dance in local contexts*, ed. Sydney Hutchinson (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2014), 4.

[2] Rosalyn Negrón, "New York City's Latino Ethnolinguistic Repertoire and the Negotiation of Latinidad in Conversation," *Journal of Sociolinguistics* 18, no. 1 (2014): 88. doi:10.1111/josl.12 063. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/josl.12063.

[3] A salsa community is defined by Skinner as a "loose and flexible group of dancers who recognize each other by name and sight […] and refer to themselves as members of the 'salsa community,' as opposed to other dance communities" (Skinner 2007, 490).

experience rather than to ethnically-limited notions of identity. While referred to in jest, latinidad is not used as a measure of (in)authenticity. In light of this, I suggest that authenticity within the Denton, Texas, salsa dance community may be more accurately understood as a bodily phenomenon tied not to race, but to the acquisition of skill and love for the dance.

Authenticating Salsa

As Sarah Weiss notes, authenticity is problematic and ill-defined. However, it has been variously understood in ethnomusico-logical discourse in terms of originality and trueness. Weiss contends that "something that is authentic conforms to an original in reproducing essential features or being done in the same way; something that is authentic is true to its own spirit or character and is, therefore believable".[4] This definition leads one to believe that in order to be authentic salsa, it must replicate the original version of the dance, both in terms of moves and, as Joanna Bosse notes, ethnic heritage. Though developed in New York City largely by musicians of Puerto Rican descent (termed 'Nuyorican' in popular and some scholarly discourse),[5] salsa music is influenced by numerous musical genres found in the Spanish-speaking portions of the Caribbean, in addition to jazz and Afro-Cuban traditions, and can be rhythmically traced back to the Cuban *son montuno.*[6] More recently, modern urban genres such as hip-hop have also begun to influence salsa in terms of both music and sound,[7] and these developments have largely been embraced by salsa dancers. Other fusion musics have been featured in numerous (semi)professional routines in festivals and congresses, and feature prominently in social dances. Salsa music and dance communities have spread around the world, with established scenes

---

[4] Sarah Weiss, "Listening to the World but Hearing Ourselves: Hybridity and Perceptions of Authenticity in World Music," *Ethnomusicology* 58, no. 3 (2014): 513; Joanna Bosse, "Salsa Dance as Cosmopolitan Formation: Cooperation, Conflict and Commerce in the Midwest United States," *Ethnomusicology Forum* 22, no. 2 (2013): 211.

[5] Bosse, 2, 5.

[6] Leonardo Acosta, "Perspectives on 'Salsa,'" *CENTRO Journal* 16, no. 2 (2004): 8, 11.

[7] Sydney Hutchinson, "Mambo on 2: The Birth of a New Dance Form in New York City," *CENTRO Journal* 16, no. 2 (2004): 128; Stefanie Claudine Boulila, "Salsa Cosmopolitanism? Consuming Racialised Difference in the European Social Dance Industry," *Leisure Studies* 37, no. 3 (2018): 247. doi:10.1080/02614367.2017.1405459. http://www.tandfonline.com/doi /abs/10.1080/02614367.2017.1405459.

in London,[8] Ghana,[9] and Japan,[10] to name but a few, and each community uses salsa to create and negotiate broader ethnic, class, and social boundaries along lines more acceptable to dancers in each place.[11] Similarly, the definition and relative importance of 'authenticity' may vary between communities, as each may foreground a different style of salsa dancing and view that style (and by extension, ethnic and cultural lineage) as more authentic or real than another.

The debate over which style or combination of styles may be considered 'real' or 'authentic' salsa is presented clearly by Cindy Garcia (2013), who connects the different styles to a desire to emphasize latinidad. Garcia maintains that, "the wars over salsa practices are not simply contestations over how to imagine and put latinidad into motion."[12] Rather, within the salsa dance community, this "war" is a battle over which dancing bodies, defined by social, ethnic, and economic status, are valued and authenticated, included and excluded within the grounds of latinidad. It should be noted that there is no singular understanding of latinidad which prevails over all others and that the use of this term is generally limited to scholars. As Skinner notes, the meaning of the dance and the identities created through its study and performance may shift from community to community and from person to person,[13] and this idea may be applied to the meaning of latinidad. Authenticity, then, may be understood as the reproduction of ideas of latinidad, as defined by a community, to the exclusion of certain socioeconomic and ethnic groups.

This understanding of authenticity, as applied to salsa, is rooted in ethnicized notions which privilege certain forms of Latinness over the undeniable influences of African and European music and ethnicities. At stake in this view is the embodied experience of a subaltern culture as expressed through dance. What makes the dance authentic is a connection to the experience of marginalized pan-Latin identity which may also be tied to experiences of immigration and perceived class hierarchies.[14] In practice, this under-standing of authenticity in salsa dancing often renders salsa danced by non-

[8] Tamara Johnson, "Salsa Politics: Desirability, Marginality, and Mobility in North Carolina's Salsa Nightclubs," *Aether* VII (2011): 103.
[9] Christey Carwile, "The Clave Comes Home: Salsa Dance and Pan-African Identity in Ghana," *African Studies Review* 60, no. 2 (2017): 184–85. doi:10.1017/asr.2017.6
[10] Kengo Iwanaga, "Diffusion and Change in Salsa Dance Styles in Japan," in *Salsa world : a global dance in local contexts*, ed. Sydney Hutchinson (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 2014), 200–1.
[11] Bosse, 212–13.
[12] Cindy Garcia, *Salsa Crossings: dancing latinidad in Los Angeles* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013), 8.
[13] Jonathan Skinner, "The Salsa Class: A Complexity of Globalization, Cosmopolitans and Emotions," *Identities* 14, no. 4 (2007): 492.
[14] Bosse, 219, 222.

Latinos as a poor simulacrum of the real thing, given that any attempt to reproduce this connection may be seen as cultural appropriation. The exclusionary nature of authenticity as defined by perceived or actual latinidad makes it problematic in a globalized dance community, for while the dance steps are tied to regional and ethnic styles of movement and may be considered authentic or not on the basis of their conformity to those styles, the qualification of a dancer as (in)authentic based on latinidad must be reconsidered.

What's in a Name? Regional Styles and Authentic Movement

Janice Mahinka, citing Chris Washburne, states that patterns of movement relative to the clave (the beat underlying salsa music and dance) are tied to ideas of ethnicity (based on which patterns are preferred by various ethnic communities) and negotiated by individual dancers, serving as a gauge for judging authenticity.[15] Bosse (2013, 2014) and Garcia (2013) echo this idea, finding the roots of salsa dancing in Cuba by way of New York City, while dancers in North Texas tend to link salsa directly with Cuba. Within New York-style dancing, known broadly as on-two or mambo, the question of salsa as an enactment of ethnicity becomes more complex. Hutchinson contends that despite being promoted as a pan-Latin dance, salsa should be understood as a distinctly Nuyorican dance style, owing to the majority of dancers, teachers, and musicians being of Puerto Rican descent.[16]

Salsa dancing is generally divided into regional styles, such as New York-style, Cuban salsa or salsa rueda,[17] Columbian salsa, Los Angeles style, and so on. Each style has characteristic movements and aesthetics, but perhaps the most significant difference is whether the style begins "on one" or "on two." L.A. style, as dancing on-one is known, begins with a step forward on the first beat of an eight-beat segment followed by a step backwards on the fifth beat. Salsa on-two, also known as New York-style or mambo, begins with a pause on beat one followed by a step forward on beat two and a step back on beat six.[18] In order to learn the correct positioning of bodies for a wide variety of moves, dancers may be taught to conceptualize slots or lanes (left, right, or center) in which they and their partner are able to move together and separately, with the emphasis placed on linear movements of the feet within a theoretical square. Numerous other distinctions, such as the speed of steps, the movement of the body in

---

[15] Janice L. Mahinka, "The Musicality of Salsa Dancers: An Ethnographic Study" (Ph.D. Dissertation, City University of New York, 2018), 172.
[16] Hutchinson, "Mambo on 2," 111.
[17] Cuban style is characterized by fast spins and partners circling around each other as opposed to dancing in a linear fashion; it is typically danced by a singular couple. When danced by couples arranged in a circle with rotating partners and coordinated by a caller, the dance is known as salsa rueda (O'Brien 2016, 7, 11).
[18] Garcia, 25.

relation to the clave rhythm, the direction of the step (forward or backwards as opposed to the right, left, or angled), and the emphasis placed on upper body movement serve to further distinguish the regional styles from each other. The figures below serve to illustrate the basic movement of the feet in salsa on-one and on-two, which is the primary way of distinguishing regional salsa styles. Note that these figures do not capture the shifting of the dancer's weight or indicate precise placement of the feet. Particularly when dancing on-two, step five may be slightly behind steps one and three depending on the dancer's momentum and step spacing.

Figure 1.1: Salsa on-one (L.A. Salsa)

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
L	R	L		R	L	R	
↑	○	↓		↓	○	↑	

Figure 1.2: Salsa on-two (New York Salsa)

1	2	3	4	5*	6	7	8
R	L	R		L	R	L	
○	↑	↓		○/↓	↓	↑	

 *Step five may be either in place or slightly behind the placement of steps 1 and 3.

Jairo (Jo) Rojas, a salsa and bachata instructor based in Denton, TX, and the founder of Salsa with Jo, teaches his students on-one, as many beginning dancers find it easier to begin moving immediately than to pause and fit their steps to the clave rhythm. As my principal salsa instructor and interlocutor, Rojas, along with his dance partner Lakyn Garza, has built a growing salsa community in Denton which frequently interacts with the larger dance community in the Dallas-Fort Worth metroplex. According to Jairo, the L.A. and New York-styles are the ones most commonly seen in the United States, due in part to salsa's origins in New York but also the ease with which novices can pick up the on-one timing of L.A. style.[19] Salsa on-two, however, is often cited as more closely tied to the dances done by the immigrant communities in New York City. The term "New York-style salsa" is a label which glosses over the sheer variety of dances performed and the variations present within them. Numerous dancers have explained to me that their preference for on-two salsa is due in large part to the perceived freedom of movement it offers. While based largely on personal comfort with the clave rhythm, this preference is somewhat ironic in that "New York Salsa" emphasizes a sense of place linked to the Latin communities of that city while minimizing the standardization of movement which enabled its commodification and spread.[20] Additionally, such broad terms

[19] Jairo Rojas, interview by author, November 6, 2019.
[20] Garcia, 1–3; Hutchinson, "What's in a Number?," 34–47.

overlook the different ideas of authenticity seen among dancers in New York and does not account for the preferences of different communities or salsa scenes within the five boroughs. As Hutchinson notes, ethnicized or racialized labels became attached to salsa as a way of marking the distinct teaching methods and styles of dance associated with them and may reflect deeper notions of latinidad and authenticity.

The importance placed on the authenticity of regional styles forces one to question whether or not a Latinx dancer may authentically engage in a different regional style. This question was raised by Rojas, as he stated,

> I'm from Colombia and I don't even dance Colombian salsa… so would you say I'm authentic? I mean, it's just dancing. And I don't think that if you don't the way [where] you're from or um, it shouldn't be an issue. Dancing is about having fun and enjoying yourself, you know and then, communicate that with other people … By putting ourselves into categories, we're like 'oh, if you're not dancing this you're not authentic,' it's just… I feel like people get discouraged 'cause they don't dance Cuban salsa, 'cause the mother of salsa is Cuban salsa.[21]

This statement made me aware of deeper issues regarding ideas of authenticity as it is tied to ethnicity. One of the problems inherent in calling salsa a pan-Latin dance is that it flattens the landscape and glosses over the nuances of each style and ignores the gendered and place-specific histories and social contexts of the dance. While scholars have largely focused on questions of authenticity regarding latinidad or insider/outsider experience, more research should be done on cross-cultural notions of authenticity among Latin salsa dancers.

Learning Salsa, Unlearning Latinidad

"White people don't dance like that!" Or so a participant in the North Texas salsa scene exclaimed in a passing jest. A Puerto Rican woman, she had been surprised to see as many Caucasian dancers as Latinx dancers doing salsa at the Mulberry Street Cantina's Latin Nights and doing it well. The mix of ethnicities present at the Cantina on Latin Nights varies, but in general there are almost equal numbers of Caucasian and Latina/o dancers. Dancers from Mexico, Cuba, Chile, and Texas abound, but questions of authenticity or ethnicity are rarely raised except in jest. What is important to these dancers is the skill, the fun, and the experience of the social dance. However, this joking

---

[21] Jairo Rojas, interview by author, November 6, 2019.

remark betrays a number of ideas concerning salsa as an expression of identity rooted in the collective experience of an ethnic group.

There remains a wide variety of views on this debate, yet it is important to note that the idea of authenticity as a trait learned by or inherent solely to a dance's originators is not unique to the salsa world. Nazgol Ghandnoosh observes a similar belief among non-African American participants in hip-hop dance but notes that the majority of those espousing authentic hip-hop as something inherent in black dancers are novices.[22] Her study revealed that professional dancers and teachers tend to share non-racialized views of the dance, focusing instead on personal skill and exposure to other dancers and dance styles as a marker of authenticity.[23] It seems, then, that as dancers became more advanced in their personal skills and more exposed to dancers at other skill levels and dance backgrounds, they slowly shed their racialized notions of authenticity and become more accepting of hip-hop as a universalized dance genre. A similar trend may be seen in salsa, where perceptions of authenticity are tied to ethnicity by novices but are less common among professional dancers and teachers.

While some dancers may be content with this idea of authenticity rooted in ethnicity, Rojas and Jacquad Reeves, a professional salsa performer who regularly participates in the North Texas dance scene, contest this claim and argue for a broader understanding of authenticity, one rooted in the bodies of the dancers themselves. In order to better understand the view shared by Rojas and others, I suggest a reframing of authenticity, rooted not in ethnicity but in the body as an aggregate of learned traditions, movements, and expressions. Yvonne Daniel states that, "Using the cultural conventions and artistic patterns that are at the core of the social group from which the dance traditions stems,... both perform-ers and tourists are often able to experience authenticity bodily and thereby, simultaneously express authenticity and creativity."[24] Here, the dancer is the locus of authenticity instead of an ethnic or social identity. Their grounding and training in the received dance is the marker of an authentic interpretation and performance, and as such, innovation that grows out of a body whose movements are rooted in tradition and influenced by the experiences and aesthetic preferences of the dancer may also be considered authentic. As both Rojas and Reeves contend, real authenticity may be understood as personal

---

[22] Nazgol Ghandnoosh, "'Cross-Cultural' Practices: Interpreting Non-African-American Participation in Hip-Hop Dance," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 9 (2010): 1587–89

[23] Ghandnoosh, 1592.

[24] Yvonne Payne Daniel, "Tourism Dance Performances Authenticity and Creativity," *Annals of Tourism Research* 23, no. 4 (1996): 795.

experience and expression within the dance itself, whether it be on-one or on-two, or even, as Reeves suggested, on three.[25]

"The Sauce"

Salsa, which translates to "sauce," is an apt metaphor for a dance both local and global, a dance in which each person brings something unique to the floor. I had heard the word translated when I first began salsa dancing in classes with Rojas, but its use there indicated that I could add more flair to my dancing, to spice up the sauce as it were. The more I danced, the more I added "spice" to my moves, and the more novice dancers at the Cantina began to ask about my ethnic background. I am of mixed African American and European descent, but Latinxs and others tend to assume that because I dance well, objectively speaking, I must be Latina. I was not surprised by this; my physical features are ethnically ambiguous, and my heritage has often been misidentified. I believed that the reason for this assumption was because the majority of dancers at the Cantina were of Latin descent; however, the more I questioned the assumption that my dancing ability must be rooted in a Latin American ethnic identity (mostly made by non-dancers), the more I began to question the notion of authenticity or skill in dancing as a signifier of ethnicity.

Jacquad Reeves has experienced similar, if opposing, assumptions. A man of Mexican and African American ethnicity, Reeves is slightly below average height with long green and black dreadlocks, dark skin and a bounce to his step. As a rising professional dancer, he and his partner, a Latina named Fabiola, have performed in multiple salsa congresses and showcases, bringing a unique blend of mambo and salsa tinged with African dance to the floor. Despite his obvious skill and love for the dance, his name, lack of overtly Hispanic facial features, and skin tone proved to be a barrier for some dancers early in his career. In his experience, judgements on perceived ethnicity can come from dancers and non-dancers alike, as he relates in the following interview excerpt:

> Actually, one time, and this, this has happened to me and to this day I always remember it, um, went to this place—went to this place called Embargo, and um, I saw these two beautiful women and I was like 'you know what, let me go get a dance with them...' you know, I was still fairly new to the scene, still trying to get my feet wet, so I was like, you know, 'hey, would you guys like to dance?' And one of the ladies had looked at me, looked at me up and down and was like, 'hell no.' And I was like, 'wow... um...okay'... um, felt the disrespect there because you looked at me head to

---

[25] Jacquad Reeves, interview by author, November 24, 2019. Dancing salsa on three is strictly hypothetical, for which all dancers can be grateful.

toe and you just said that, but you know, it was okay.
[...] There was a chick I knew that was in classes. It
was this Caucasian lady [...] um... but um... I remember
she was taking lessons, and...so I just asked her I was
like 'hey, I know you just got here, you just got your
shoes on, you know, let's dance.' And of course, you
know, she's like, 'oh yeah of course, let's do it.' So I
danced right in front of those women, and of course,
you know they looked at her too and kind of like, tried
to belittle her. It was like, 'these guys out here,
thinking they can dance, trying to dance our music,' all
that other stuff you know. She was really good, and so
we started dancing, and as soon as they saw her do like
a basic double spin, like their jaws just dropped. And
then we started freestyling, you know, just hitting the
basic Suzy Q footwork, Suzy Plus, and just right-hand
turns, left-hand turns, you know just feeling the music
and again, the same lady who looked at me and said
"hell no," her jaw had dropped. After we got done
dancing, I went back to them and asked the friend to
dance with me—I walked up to the chick whose jaw
had dropped and I went and asked her friend
something like, "do you want to dance," and of course
she changed her mind.[26]

As Reeves notes, initial judgements on one's ability to dance
may be based on one's apparent ethnicity, but skill and authentic
expression of salsa can unfold throughout the course of the dance. The
lack of apparent latinidad, as Garcia would say, caused the observers
to question his authenticity, but his skill in using the music to express
his personal experience of salsa dancing created cognitive dissonance
for the ladies on the sidelines. The idea that salsa is in the blood or
that authenticity is a cultural inheritance may be deconstructed by
arguments for the cosmopolitan aspects of the dance; its location in a
transnational sphere and the lack of access to a singular original
source may, as Katherine Wilson suggests, be a reason to disconnect
salsa from the Latino/a culture as a way to deconstruct essentialist
(racialized) ideas of authenticity.[27] However, as Reeves continued his
story, it became apparent that disconnecting salsa from Latinx culture
and making it an a-cultural, cosmopolitan dance is not a real solution
to the problem of exclusion based on ethnicity. While it may solve the
immediate problem of ethnic association/exclusion, it does not
account for the difference between emic and etic understandings of

[26] Jacquad Reeves, interview by author, November 24, 2019.
[27] Katherine Wilson, "The space of salsa: Theory and implications of a global
dance phenomenon," in *Looking at Ourselves: Multiculturalism, Conflict and
Belonging*, ed. Katherine Wilson (Oxford: Inter-Disciplinary Press), 241–48,
cited in Boulila, 246–47.

authenticity stemming from different degrees of involvement in the dance community. As he noted,

> I think it's more so the people who are not in the dance world who consider the authentic dance style also within your ethnicity… The same lady who looked at me and said hell no, her jaw had dropped. After we got done dancing, I went back to them and asked the friend to dance with me—I walked up to the chick whose jaw had dropped and I went and asked her friend something like, do you want to dance, and of course she changed her mind. Umm, but yeah so, there are a lot of times where… oof, you know, but I think it's more so the people who are not in the dance world who consider the authentic dance style also within your ethnicity.[28]

The difference in perspective between one inside the dance world and one outside is crucial, for while those on the outside or beginning to enter into salsa communities may cling to racialized notions of authenticity, those on the inside have entered into a cosmopolitan formation,[29] as Bosse (2013) claims, and have begun to embody both the dance and the communal aesthetics which are instilled in the learning process. The body, which, following Daniels, is the locus of authenticity, becomes authenticated as the dancers becomes enmeshed into the cosmopolitan network of salsa dancing by grounding themselves in the tradition of dancing. Over the course of a night of salsa dancing, what becomes clear is that the body is both the means of communication and authentication for a dancer. Body language and unspoken assumptions regarding skill and perceived ethnicity say as much, if not more, than words. For as assumptions about dancing bodies can color perceptions of authenticity, they may also have a strong influence on one's choice of partner and willingness to dance. Yet, as Rojas noted, so long as salsa is the foundation of the music and dance, any school or style of salsa could be considered authentic. Rojas argues that,

> We are in the era of collaboration… meaning that there is room not just for salseros, but also for a fusion of Afrocuban and Puerto Rican salsa, there's, you know, there is room for both…. We have to be open about it… salsa has been so influenced by other genres like jazz

---

[28] Jacquad Reeves, interview by author, November 24, 2019.
[29] Bosse defines cosmopolitanism as "a network of shared and articulated values across geographical, racial, and ethnic divides." This network connects people across vast divides and reinforces relationships to create a kind of supranational imagined community, one not tied to a specific place, but rather to a central subject with which all members engage (Bosse 2013, 223).

and timbales…so is there a limit? As long as you can hear the rhythm of salsa… as long as you have that foundation of salsa and you can hear it… It's not salsa if you don't have the roots of the music.[30]

The interviews with Jairo Rojas and Jacquad Reeves revealed another aspect of authenticity in salsa: while dancers may prefer one style to another, they are often familiar with multiple styles of salsa in particular and dances in general. In attending both Latin Nights at the Mulberry Cantina and social dances held at other venues, I have seen numerous dancers moving between the styles based on their partners' abilities, the song being played, and their own preferences; I have also seen moves from hip-hop and other genres incorporated into salsa both on the social dance floor and in professional performance. While there is arguably a difference between the performance of salsa in competition or professional performance and salsa as performed within the context of the social dance, the idea of one ethnicity or even one style of salsa being more authentic than another breaks down when one considers that what is expressed in the dance is not a formalized set of steps, but rather a basic step filtered through the entirety of the dancer's body. The precise mechanics of the movements are flavored by the dancer's preferences and prior training and authenticated within the cosmopolitan salsa community in which they dance.[31]

"Salsa is the sauce…"

Debates over what makes salsa dancing authentic and who may be considered authentic may continue indefinitely, for ideas about the place of ethnicity, latinidad, personality, and authenticity will continue to evolve in every social space where dancers gather. What has become apparent through this study is that for those dancers enmeshed in the North Texas salsa scene, authenticity is not generally tied to ideas of latinidad, ethnicity, or even dancing specifically on-one as opposed to on-two. Indeed, those identifiers, which may not be outwardly apparent, are not the most important aspects of authentic salsa to many dancers. What is important in each style is the experience of ownership over and engagement in the global discourse surrounding salsa dance. As Hutchinson notes, the various named styles came about partially as a way of recognizing the origins of each type of salsa, but also as a means for teachers and

---

[30] Jairo Rojas, interview by author, November 6, 2019.
[31] Marks of approval and disapproval vary greatly between communities; individuals who join a local community with previous dance experience may bring their own signs of approval and disapproval. Approval may be noted with a shout of "Eso!" or repeated requests for a dance while disapproval may be indicated with verbal corrections or on-the-floor instruction. Being refused dances, or simply not being asked, can signal that a dancer is either not known or not a desirable partner.

performers to market their unique styles.[32] Thus, alongside economic aspects, the regional and racialized names of the various styles have become markers of identity which allow each community to engage in and legitimize the dance as seen through their cultural lens.

Naming a style in association with an ethnicity or geographic location may be a way of enabling diverse communities to authenticcate their experience of the dance and assert a measure of ownership over salsa as both an identity and an activity. However, the idea that authentic salsa is in the blood or rooted in one's ethnicity tends to break down as dancers become enmeshed in the transnational cosmopolitan communities with which they interact. While some may still view authentic salsa dancing as a property accessible only to those of Latin descent, Rojas and Reeves, along with other dancers in North Texas, seem to take this idea lightly and acknowledge that while it may have been an idea they came in with, it was dispelled by both their own growth and their interactions with other dancers. For them, what makes the dance authentic is the dancer and their ability to bring the whole of their dancing experience and their personality to the dance floor. This echoes Daniel's argument for the dancer's body as the locus of authenticity; instead of focusing on one's ethnicity or a sense of latinidad, the dancer's entire person (including their training, background, skills, and innovations) serves to ground them in the dance and branch out into the global community of salsa dancers. Each dancing body and their unique understanding and expression of salsa, if they are rooted in the dance, may then be considered authentic. Or, as Jacquad Reeves stated, "Salsa is the sauce, we're all just adding our own ingredients to the pot."[33]

---

[32] Hutchinson, "What's in a number?", 31–37.

[33] Jacquad Reeves, interview by author, November 24, 2019.

Works Cited:

Acosta, Leonardo. "Perspectives on 'Salsa.'" *CENTRO Journal* 16, no. 2 (2004): 6–13. https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:9443/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=15035700&scope=site.

Bock, Sheila. "Exotic Identities: Dance, Difference, and Self-Fashioning." *Journal of Folklore Research* 48, no. 1 (2011): 1–36. https://search.proquest.com/docview/878603677.

Borland, Katherine. "Embracing Difference: Salsa Fever in New Jersey." *Journal of American Folklore: Journal of the American Folklore Society (Arlington, VA)* 122, no. 486 (2009): 466. http://gateway.proquest.com/openurl?ctx_ver=Z39.88-2003&xri:pqil:resver=0.2&res_id=xri:ilcs-us&rft_id=xri:ilcs:rec:abell:R04212152.

Bosse, Joanna. "Salsa Dance and the Transformation of Style: An Ethnographic Study of Movement and Meaning in a Cross-Cultural Context." *Dance Research Journal* 40, no. 1 (2008): 45–64. https://search.proquest.com/docview/2040562.

———. "Salsa Dance as Cosmopolitan Formation: Cooperation, Conflict and Commerce in the Midwest United States." *Ethnomusicology Forum* 22, no. 2 (2013): 210–31. doi:10.1080/17411912.2013.809256. http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/17411912.2013.809256.

———. "Small-Town Cosmopolitans: Salsa Dance in Rural America." In *Salsa World: a global dance in local contexts*, edited by Sydney Hutchinson, 80–97. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2014.

Boulila, Stefanie Claudine. "Salsa Cosmopolitanism? Consuming Racialised Difference in the European Social Dance Industry." *Leisure Studies* 37, no. 3 (2018): 243–55. doi:10.1080/02614367.2017.1405459. http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/02614367.2017.1405459.

Buckland, Theresa Jill. "Dance, Authenticity and Cultural Memory: The Politics of Embodiment." *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 33 (2001): 1–16. doi:10.2307/1519626.

Carwile, Christey. "The Clave Comes Home: Salsa Dance and Pan-African Identity in Ghana." *African Studies Review* 60, no. 2 (2017): 183–207. doi:10.1017/asr.2017.6

Cobb, Russell, ed. *The Paradox of Authenticity in a Globalized World*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014. doi:10.1057/9781137

353832. http://www.palgraveconnect.com/doifinder/10.1057/ 9781137353832.

Daniel, Yvonne Payne. "Tourism Dance Performances Authenticity and Creativity." *Annals of Tourism Research* 23, no. 4 (1996): 780–97. doi:10.1016/0160-7383(96)00020-5. https://www. sciencedirect. com/science/article/pii/0160738396000205.

Garcia, Cindy. *Salsa Crossings: dancing latinidad in Los Angeles*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013.

Ghandnoosh, Nazgol. "'Cross-Cultural' Practices: Interpreting Non-African-American Participation in Hip-Hop Dance." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 9 (2010): 1580–99. doi:10.1080/01419 870903548799. http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080 /01419870903548799.

Hutchinson, Sydney. "Mambo on 2: The Birth of a New Dance Form in New York City," *CENTRO Journal* 16, no. 2 (2004):109–137.

———. "Dancing in Place: An Introduction." In *Salsa World: a global dance in local contexts*, edited by Sydney Hutchinson, 1–25. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2014.

———. "What's in a Number? From Local Nostalgia to Global Marketability in New York's On-2 Salsa." In *Salsa World: a global dance in local contexts*, edited by Sydney Hutchinson, 26–45. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2014.

Iwanaga, Kengo. "Diffusion and Change in Salsa Dance Styles in Japan." In *Salsa World: A Global Dance in Local Contexts*, edited by Sydney Hutchinson (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 2014), 200–12.

Johnson, Tamara. "Salsa Politics: Desirability, Marginality, and Mobility in North Carolina's Salsa Nightclubs." *Aether* VII (2011): 97–118.

Mahinka, Janice L. "The Musicality of Salsa Dancers: An Ethnographic Study." Ph.D. Dissertation, City University of New York, 2018. https://search.proquest.com/docview/2033448987.

Negrón, Rosalyn. "New York City's Latino Ethnolinguistic Repertoire and the Negotiation of Latinidad in Conversation." *Journal of Sociolinguistics* 18, no. 1 (2014): 87–118. doi:10.1111/josl.12 063. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/josl.120 63.

O'Brien, Juliette. "Negotiating Salsa Through Global Matrices." *Journal of Emerging Dance Scholarship* IV (2016): 1–20. https://www.

jedsonline.net/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/5-Negotiation-Salsa-Word.pdf.

Peterson, Richard A. "In Search of Authenticity." *Journal of Management Studies* 42, no. 5 (2005): 1083–98. doi:10.1111/j.1467-6486.2005.00533.x.https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1467-6486.2005.00533.x.

Poole, Adrian Ian. "Groove in Cuban Dance Music: An Analysis of Son and Salsa." Ph.D. Thesis, The Open University, 2013. https://search.proquest.com/docview/2307386876.

Quintero-Rivera, Ángel G., and George Leddy. "Cultural Struggles for Hegemony: Salsa, Migration, and Globalization." *Latin American Perspectives* 38, no. 2 (2011): 58–70. doi:10.1177/0094582X10388623. https://www.jstor.org/stable/29779320.

Renta, Priscilla. "Salsa Dance: Latino/a History in Motion." *CENTRO Journal* XVI, no. 2 (2004): 139–57.

Skinner, Jonathan. "The Salsa Class: A Complexity of Globalization, Cosmopolitans and Emotions." *Identities* 14, no. 4 (2007): 485–506. doi:10.1080/10702890701578480. http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10702890701578480.

Weiss, Sarah. "Listening to the World but Hearing Ourselves: Hybridity and Perceptions of Authenticity in World Music." *Ethnomusicology* 58, no. 3 (2014): 506–25. Accessed September 19, 2020. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5406/ethnomusicology.58.3.0506.

Urquía, Norman. "The Re-Branding of Salsa in London's Dance Clubs: How an Ethnicised Form of Cultural Capital was Institutionalised." *Leisure Studies* 24, no. 4 (2005): 385–97. doi:10.1080/02614360500200698. https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2147/10.1080/026143605002006.

About the Contributors

JÚLIA COELHO is pursuing a Ph.D. in Musicology and a DMA in Vocal Performance, with related fields in Early Music and in Music Theory. She has completed her Master's Degrees in Musicology and Opera at the University of Missouri and the Conservatory of Avellino in Italy. In Portugal, she completed her B.A. in Philosophy with a minor in foreign languages. She currently works as a doctoral teaching assistant in Music History and has been serving as a Musicology student representative in GAMuT, as well as a Music Senator in the Graduate Student Council. She will serve as the journal editor for the 2021–22 *Harmonia* edition.

With research interests in 16th- to 18th-century vocal music, music and rhetoric, and history of music theory, she has presented papers at national and international conferences on Claudio Monteverdi and W. A. Mozart, and has given lecture-recitals on Thomas Campion and on Portuguese music, history, and culture. She has musicology publications in English, Portuguese, and Italian, namely a peer-reviewed article on Claudio Monteverdi's *Orfeo* (2019), a book translation from Italian to English on Pietro Cerone and Wolfgang Schonsleder (2018), an annotated translation from English to Italian of Charles Burney's account on Händel's *Messiah* (2015), as well as Fox Keller's book review on Gender Philosophy, *Reflections on Gender and Science* (2010). She has recently completed a collaborative book chapter called "The Art of Liminality: Sea, *Saudade*, and Liminality," in *The Liminal Loop* (forthcoming, 2021), on thirteenth-century Galician-Portuguese *cantigas d'amigo*.

In addition to her research activities, she teaches a studio of voice students and performs weekly at Denton Unitarian Universalist Fellowship as the Song/Hymn Leader, where she often accompanies her singing at the Gothic harp, psaltery, or keyboard.

STACEY KEY is a fifth year Ph.D. student in Ethnomusicology and a fellow in the Ethnomusicology areas. She received two Toulouse Graduate School Academic Achievement Scholarships. Stacey holds a Master of Arts in Ethnomusicology from the University of Limerick, Ireland and completed her Bachelor of Arts in Music at Geneva College. Her research interests include American popular and religious music, Irish traditional vocal music, and applied research. Her current research focuses on Irish funeral laments (*caoineadh*) and their modern incarnations.